

Scenario 1 - Current use of farrowing crates in pig production

Score sheet

Name of scor Expert 11

Comments

Welfare principles	Welfare criteria	Highest level of welfare = 100			1st round			2nd round			Comments
		0 – Lowest level of welfare	100% certain lower bound	100% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	
Good feeding	1	Provision and access to food. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of appropriate foodstuffs for health and wellbeing.	25	20	60	25	20	I have thought of this as 1 sow year + 13 pig years as an indoor sow produces 2.7 pigs/yr each for her approx 6 months. Then I also considered that the sow spends approx 1/4 of the year in the crate	I drew a lot on the EFSA opinion and other research		
	2	Provision and access to water. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of water for health and wellbeing.	90	80	95	90	80	Sows are v hungry almost all of the time, pigs are not hungry. Food is not interesting or tasty for promoting foraging. There is often competition around feeders. Straw available to eat for sows 60 usually, but may be dirty, less likely in crate produced pigs. Basically usually provided sufficiently but occasionally drinkers don't work and there can be competition around the drinker esp if they play with it. I don't think choice of water type etc 90 has anything like the value of food.	I was really struggling with weighing up the 1 & 1. In the end I accepted a kind of internal cheat that gave greater weight to the hunger of the sows than the safety of the pigs.		
Good housing	3	Animals should have comfort when resting.	10	5	40	10	5	Some sows are deep bedded but most crate-derived pigs will not be. Abst of straw may be 40 available to the sows. Appalling comfort in the crate.			
	4	Animals should have thermal comfort being neither too hot nor too cold.	70	50	80	70	50	Most houses are temp controlled but can still be cold/hot 40 The crates are dire, most small pens for sows or pigs are inadequate, only large pens really afford some space to move freely.			
Good health	5	Animals should have sufficient space to move freely.	20	15	40	20	15				
	6	Animals should be free from injuries and disorders (e.g. skin conditions, lameness, bone fractures etc.).	35	20	60	35	20	60 High prev of lameness in sows, bursts in all, skin lesions, TB			
Appropriate behaviour	7	Animals should be free from disease, including metabolic conditions, with high standards of health care and hygiene.	50	40	60	50	40	60 Lots of pigs are too dirty, some dx issues			
	8	Animals should not suffer pain - for example as a result of poor management, handling, surgical or other procedures, slaughter etc.	60	50	70	60	50	70 pigs most likely docked and teeth clipped.	few opportunities for normal social behaviour in crate (restrictions), between adult sows (either flux of large groups or small pens) and growing pigs (some mixing likely and barren 50 environment means more negative social interactions)		
	9	Animals should be able to express normal, non-harmful social behaviours (such as grooming and social bonding).	20	15	50	20	15	Only animals in deep beds will likely have partial normal foraging behaviour, this is a minority 45 of crate-born pigs			
	10	Animals should be able to express other normal behaviours (e.g. foraging, exploring).	10	5	45	10	5				
	11	Animals should be handled well with positive and not negative animal-human relationships.	35	25	50	35	25	50 Limited human interactions, mostly not very positive			
	12	Additional aspects not already adequately covered above in relation to the balance between positive and negative affective states for animals.	60	50	80	60	50	80 Nausea during transport			

Scenario 2 - Free farrowing

Score sheet

Name of scorer: Expert 11

Comments

Welfare principles	Welfare criteria	Highest level of welfare = 100			1st round			2nd round			Comments
		0 – Lowest level of welfare	100% certain lower bound	100% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	
Good feeding	1	Provision and access to food. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of appropriate foodstuffs for health and wellbeing.	25	20	60	25	20	60	25	20	60 no sig change
	2	Provision and access to water. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of water for health and wellbeing.	90	80	95	90	80	95	90	80	95 no sig change
Good housing	3	Animals should have comfort when resting.	15	5	40	15	5	40	15	5	40 marginal improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows only
	4	Animals should have thermal comfort being neither too hot nor too cold.	70	50	80	70	50	80	70	50	80 no sig change
Good health	5	Animals should have sufficient space to move freely.	32	15	40	32	15	40	32	15	40 some improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows only
	6	Animals should be free from injuries and disorders (e.g. skin conditions, lameness, bone fractures etc.).	35	20	60	35	20	60	35	20	60 no sig change
Good health	7	Animals should be free from disease, including metabolic conditions, with high standards of health care and hygiene.	50	40	60	50	40	60	50	40	60 no sig change
	8	Animals should not suffer pain - for example as a result of poor management, handling, surgical or other procedures, slaughter etc.	60	50	70	60	50	70	60	50	70 no sig change
Appropriate behaviour	9	Animals should be able to express normal, non-harmful social behaviours (such as grooming and social bonding).	30	15	50	30	15	50	30	15	50 improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows and for 3/26 wks for piglets
	10	Animals should be able to express other normal behaviours (e.g. foraging, exploring).	10	5	45	10	5	45	10	5	45 no sig change
Appropriate behaviour	11	Animals should be handled well with positive and not negative animal-human relationships.	35	25	50	35	25	50	35	25	50 no sig change
	12	Additional aspects not already adequately covered above in relation to the balance between positive and negative affective states for animals.	60	50	80	60	50	80	60	50	80 no sig change

Scenario 3 - Temporary use of farrowing crates

Score sheet

Name of scorer: Expert 11

Comments

Welfare principles	Welfare criteria	Highest level of welfare = 100			1st round			2nd round			Comments
		0 – Lowest level of welfare	100% certain lower bound	100% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	score	90% certain lower bound	90% certain upper bound	
Good feeding	1	Provision and access to food. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of appropriate foodstuffs for health and wellbeing.	25	20	60	25	20	60	25	20	60 no sig change
	2	Provision and access to water. Animals should have appropriate access to the quantity and quality of water for health and wellbeing.	90	80	95	90	80	95	90	80	95 no sig change
Good housing	3	Animals should have comfort when resting.	11	5	40	11	5	40	11	5	40 marginal improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows only
	4	Animals should have thermal comfort being neither too hot nor too cold.	70	50	80	70	50	80	70	50	80 no sig change
Good health	5	Animals should have sufficient space to move freely.	30	15	40	30	15	40	30	15	40 some improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows only
	6	Animals should be free from injuries and disorders (e.g. skin conditions, lameness, bone fractures etc.).	35	20	60	35	20	60	35	20	60 no sig change
Good health	7	Animals should be free from disease, including metabolic conditions, with high standards of health care and hygiene.	50	40	60	50	40	60	50	40	60 no sig change
	8	Animals should not suffer pain - for example as a result of poor management, handling, surgical or other procedures, slaughter etc.	60	50	70	60	50	70	60	50	70 no sig change
Appropriate behaviour	9	Animals should be able to express normal, non-harmful social behaviours (such as grooming and social bonding).	25	15	50	25	15	50	25	15	50 some improvement during around 10 wks/yr for sows and for 3/26 wks for piglets
	10	Animals should be able to express other normal behaviours (e.g. foraging, exploring).	10	5	45	10	5	45	10	5	45 no sig change
Appropriate behaviour	11	Animals should be handled well with positive and not negative animal-human relationships.	35	25	50	35	25	50	35	25	50 no sig change
	12	Additional aspects not already adequately covered above in relation to the balance between positive and negative affective states for animals.	60	50	80	60	50	80	60	50	80 no sig change